Penambahbaikan Pembangunan Guru dan Kualiti Pendidikan di China dan Asia Timur

Ringkasan Polisi

Improving Teacher Development and Educational Quality in China and East Asia

Policy Brief

Pengenalan
Introduction

Kajian-kajian dalam konteks antarabangsa seperti di USA dan UK menekankan nilai dan peranan "Profesional Learning Communities" (PLC) untuk mengukuhkan amalan profesional (Stoll & Louis, 2007). Terdapat juga bukti yang positif, iaitu sekolah beroperasi sebagai komuniti pembelajaran profesional (Lomos et al, 2012; Thomas 2010). Oleh itu, peningkatan minat untuk mengkaji konsep ini di peringkat antarabangsa dan secara spesifik di China dan Asia Timur bukanlah sesuatu perkara yang mengejutkan (Hannum et al, 2007; Sargent & Hannum, 2009; Wong 2010a; 2010b). Sejak pengenalan sistem ekonomi berasaskan pasaran, pusat kerajaan China telah mengaitkan pencapaian pertumbuhan ekonomi dengan keperluan mereformasi pendidikan untuk menangani cabaran-cabaran globalisasi. Hal ini melibatkan beberapa siri reformasi kurikulum dan pentaksiran. 10 Tahun Pelan Reformasi dan Pembangunan Pendidikan Kebangsaan China (CMOE, 2010) memberi pencerahan secara spesifik tentang keperluan untuk memperbaiki kualiti pengajaran, kaedah dan pendekatan. Cabaran yang sama juga wujud di negara-negara Timur Asia dan perubahan ini sedang berlaku.

Research studies in a range of international contexts such as USA and UK have emphasised the value and role of professional learning communities (PLCs) to enhance professional practice (Stoll & Louis, 2007). There is also growing evidence of the positive outcomes of schools operating as professional learning communities (Lomos et al, 2012; Thomas 2010), and so it is not surprising to find increasing interest in exploring the concept internationally, and specifically in China and East Asia (Hannum et al, 2007; Sargent & Hannum, 2009; Wong 2010a; 2010b). Since the introduction of a market-based economic system, the central government in China has linked achieving economic growth and a need for educational reform designed to meet the challenges of globalization. This has involved an accelerating series of reforms of curriculum and assessment. The Chinese ten-year plan National Plan for Education Reform and Development (CMOE, 2010) highlighted in particular the need to improve teaching quality, methods and approaches. Moreover, similar challenges exist and reforms are underway in other East Asian countries.

Walau bagaimanapun, di Tanah Besar China, kajian empirik mengenai topik ini tidak banyak. Walaupun sebilangan pengkaji menyatakan PLC sebenarnya adalah sebahagian daripada struktur organisasi rasmi dalam sistem pendidikan, namun sebahagian besarnya adalah dalam bentuk pengajaran dan kumpulan kajian sekolah (Teddlie & Lui, 2008). Di samping itu, terdapat kajian yang menunjukkan ramai guru berpendapat pembelajaran profesional di China masih kurang berkembang dan kepuasan terhadap

aktiviti Pembangunan Profesional Berterusan (CPD) adalah rendah (Zhao et al, 2009). Ada juga bukti yang menunjukkan bahawa akses guru kepada CPD adalah tidak sama rata, kerana golongan guru yang terpinggir ini dan mereka yang bertugas di kawasan pedalaman kurang mendapat peluang untuk melibatkan diri secara bermakna dengan pembangunan profesional (Robinson, & Yi, 2008). Di samping itu, peningkatan kualiti pendidikan adalah penting dalam mengurangkan kemiskinan di China juga telah dibuktikan (Zhang & Zhao, 2006). Oleh itu, sekarang adalah masa yang sesuai dan perlu untuk mempertimbangkan ciri dan realiti pembangunan profesional guru serta penggunaan konsep PLC dalam meningkatkan kualiti guru dan keberkesanan sekolah.

However, in mainland China, little empirical research exists on this topic although some researchers have argued that PLCs typically exist as part of the formal organisational structure of the education system, largely in the form of teaching and school research groups (Teddlie & Lui, 2008). Other research indicates that for many teachers in China professional learning is underdeveloped and that their satisfaction with CPD activities is low (Zhao et al, 2009). Moreover, there are indications that teachers' access to CPD is not equitable, with those in disadvantaged and rural areas having fewer opportunities to participate meaningfully in professional development (Robinson, & Yi, 2008). Given the importance of raising educational quality to reduce poverty in China (Zhang & Zhao, 2006), it is timely and essential to consider the nature and reality of teachers professional development as well as the utility of professional learning communities concept to enhance teacher quality and school effectiveness.

Dalam konteks ini, evidens daripada projek *Improving Teacher Development & Educational Quality in China* (ITDEQC) telah menunjukkan bahawa sekolah-sekolah di China yang berkembang sebagai komuniti pembelajaran profesional yang efektif boleh memberikan sumbangan yang bermakna bagi mencapai reformasi dan perubahan pendidikan yang diinginkan (Thomas et al 2015). Oleh itu, ringkasan polisi ini dan ITDEQC *teachers' tool kit* sebagai alat bantu guru bertujuan untuk menyokong perkembangan PLC dengan menyediakan rancangan yang telah dipelajari dan contoh-contoh amalan terbaik daripada kajian kes PLC sekolah-sekolah di China. Bahan PLC ini bukan sahaja relevan kepada guru-guru di China, malahan kepada guru-guru di negara Asia Timur juga yang mengamalkan budaya Confucius.

In this context, the evidence from the ITDEQC project indicates that Chinese schools developing as effective professional learning communities could meaningfully contribute to achieving the desired educational reforms and change (Thomas et al 2015). Therefore, this policy brief and the ITDEQC teachers' toolkit seeks to support the development of PLCs by providing lessons learned and best practice exemplars from PLCs in Chinese case study schools. These PLC materials are relevant to Chinese teachers but are also designed to be potentially useful to teachers in other Confucian heritage countries in East Asia.

Projek Penambahbaikan Perkembangan Guru dan Kualiti Pendidikan di China (ITDEQC)
Improving Teacher Development and Educational Quality in China (ITDEQC) Project

Evidens yang diperoleh merupakan dapatan daripada projek penyelidikan gabungan UK-China "Projek Penambahbaikan Perkembangan Guru dan Kualiti Pendidikan di China" yang ditaja oleh UKAID/DfID (IEEQC/ITDEQC, 2017). Penyelidikan ini mengkaji kewujudan dan kerelevanan komuniti pembelajaran profesional (PLC) untuk mempromosikan hasil pelajar dan pembangunan guru di sekolah menengah senior di China. Data kuantitatif dan kualitatif yang dipungut dan dianalisis termasuklah temu bual dan kumpulan fokus dengan 90+ pihak yang berkepentingan (stakeholders) dan satu tinjauan yang melibatkan 17,000+ guru dari 3 wilayah. Kaedah-kaedah PLC yang dipromosikan dan dilestarikan di sekolah telah dikenal pasti daripada peenggubal dasar kebangsaan dan empat kajian kes sekolah yang

terperinci telah dipilih berdasarkan *"value added effectiveness"* dan kawasan pedalaman/bandar. Secara keseluruhannya, projek ini cuba menyediakan data kualiti untuk meningkatkan pemahaman mengenai pembangunan dan pembelajaran guru, iaitu bagaimana aspek-aspek ini berkait dengan keberkesanan dan penambahbaikan sekolah dan cara pelestarian pembangunan guru dapat disokong.

The evidence we draw on comes from the findings of a joint UK-China research project "Improving Teacher Development and Educational Quality in China" funded by UKAID/DfID (IEEQC/ITDEQC, 2017). The research investigated the existence and relevance of professional learning communities (PLCs) to promote student outcomes and teacher development in Chinese senior secondary schools. Both quantitative and qualitative data were collected and analysed including interviews and focus groups with 90+ stakeholders and a survey of 17,000+ teachers in three regions. The ways PLCs are promoted and sustained in Chinese schools were identified from national policy makers and four detailed case study schools, selected on the basis of "value added effectiveness" and rural/urban location. Overall, the project sought to provide quality data to enhance understanding of teacher development and learning, how these aspects relate to school effectiveness and improvement and how sustainable teacher development can be promoted.

Definisi PLC dalam projek ITDEQC adalah seperti berikut: *"Sebuah komuniti pembelajaran profesional (PLC) ialah sekumpulan orang yang inklusif, dimotivasikan oleh perkongsian visi pembelajaran, yang menyokong dan bekerja bersama-sama, mencari cara di dalam dan di luar komuniti mereka yang rapat, untuk mencari informasi mengenai amalan mereka dan bersama-sama belajar pendekatan yang baharu dan lebih baik bagi meningkatkan pembelajaran pelajar"*

The definition of PLC used in the ITDEQC project was as follows: *"A professional learning community (PLC) is an inclusive group of people, motivated by a shared learning vision, who support and work with each other, finding ways, inside and outside their immediate community, to enquire on their practice and together learn new and better approaches that will enhance all students' learning."*

Definisi ini diambil daripada *bahan sumber untuk pemimpin sekolah dan pemimpin dalam pembelajaran profesional* (Stoll et al, 2006), dan dihasilkan daripada penyelidikan mengenai mereka dan melestari komuniti pembelajaran profesional secara efektif (Bolam et al 2005) yang ditaja oleh kerajaan UK. Matlamat utama projek ITDEQC adalah untuk mengeksplorasi dan menguji kewujudan dan persepsi pihak yang berkepentingan terhadap lapan ciri PLC dan empat proses yang menyokong dan melestari PLC di negara China seperti yang dikenal pasti oleh Bolam dan rakan-rakannya:

Lapan Ciri PLC: Perkongsian nilai dan visi, Tanggungjawab secara kolektif terhadap pembelajaran pelajar, Kolaborasi berfokus terhadap pembelajaran, Pembelajaran profesional sama ada secara kumpulan mahupun individu, Inkuiri reflektif profesional, Keterbukaan, Jaringan dan perkongsian, Keahlian inklusif, Saling percaya, hormat dan sokongan.
Empat Proses untuk membentuk PLC: Mengoptimumkan sumber dan struktur untuk menyokong PLC, Menyokong pembelajaran profesional, Menilai dan melestari PLC, Memimpin dan menguruskan untuk menyokong PLC.

This definition was taken from the *source materials, for school leaders and other leaders of professional learning* (Stoll et al, 2006), produced from UK government-funded research into creating and sustaining effective professional learning communities (Bolam et al 2005). A key aim of the ITDEQC project was to explore and test out in the Chinese context the existence and stakeholder perceptions of eight PLC characteristics and four processes which promote and sustain them, as identified by Bolam and colleagues:

Eight Characteristics of a PLC: Shared values and vision, Collective responsibility for students' learning, Collaboration focused on learning, Group as well as individual professional learning, Reflective professional enquiry, Openness, networks and partnerships, Inclusive Membership, Mutual trust, respect and support.

Four Processes to develop a PLC: Optimising resources and structures to promote the PLC, Promoting professional learning, Evaluating and sustaining the PLC, Leading and managing to promote the PLC.

Perbezaan utama antara PLC dan konsep "komuniti pembelajaran sekolah" ialah fokus PLC yang menekankan pembangunan guru dan impak pengajaran guru kepada hasil pelajar. Secara keseluruhannya, dua konsep ini bertindan tetapi idea "komuniti pembelajaran sekolah" lebih meluas dengan penumpuan kepada aspek konteks pembelajaran dan proses semua individu dalam komuniti sekolah.

A key difference between PLCs and the related concept of "school learning community" is that PLCs are primarily focused on teacher development and the impact of teacher learning on student outcomes. Overall the two concepts overlap, but the idea of a "school learning community" is a broader concept highlighting the learning context and processes of all individuals in the school community.

Apa yang dapat dipelajari daripada PLC di China?
What are the lessons learned about PLCs in China?

Dapatan kajian ITDEQC menunjukkan bahawa konsep PLC adalah relevan dan berguna dalam konteks China. Kedua-dua sub-PLC dan PLC sekolah seolah-olah wujud. Walau bagaimanapun, pemahaman peserta kajian mengenai PLC adalah pelbagai. Begitu juga dengan pendapat mereka mengenai ciri-ciri PLC yang wujud di sekolah atau secara umumnya di sekolah-sekolah China. Secara tipikalnya dan sejajar juga dengan kajian terdahulu (Wong, 2010), pihak yang berkepentingan mengaitkan PLC dengan amalan guru bekerja dalam kumpulan penyelidikan dan pengajaran dan, mekanisme pembangunan profesional sedia ada seperti pementoran, kolaborasi dan pengajaran model. Walaupun semua sekolah kes menggunakan kumpulan pembelajaran sebagai mekanisme yang mengorganisasi pengurusan, tetapi terdapat perbezaan dari aspek pengoperasian dan juga cara peserta menerangkan penglibatan dan tujuan mereka. Sebagai contohnya, penglibatan inkuiri reflektif yang lebih atau kurang bermakna. Namun begitu, pelajar di empat sekolah terbabit menyatakan bahawa mereka mendapat sokongan daripada guru. Pelajar ini merupakan pelajar tahun akhir dan sedang membuat persediaan untuk mengambil peperiksaan kemasukan ke kolej. Mereka merujuk kepada amalan guru yang berkaitan dengan kekerapan memberi maklum balas formal. Mereka menjangkakan sesuatu dan nampak perubahan sebagai hasil daripada maklum balas guru.

The findings from the ITDEQC study indicate that the concept of PLCs is relevant and useful in the Chinese context, both established sub-PLCs, as well as whole school PLCs seem to exist. However, participants understanding of the concept varied, as did their view of how far features of a PLC were evident in their own schools or more generally in Chinese schools. Typically and in line with previous research (Wong, 2010), stakeholders linked PLCs with their established practice of teachers working in teaching and research groups, and other existing professional development mechanisms such as strong support for mentoring, collaboration and model lessons. Although all the case schools used teaching groups as an organising mechanism for management they differed in the ways these groups operated and in the ways participants described their involvement and purposes, for example involving more or less meaningful reflective enquiry. Nevertheless, students in all four case study schools said they felt supported by teachers – though these were all final year students and preparing for the college

entrance exam. They all referred to giving regular formal feedback on teachers' practice. They expected, and saw, changes as a result of their feedback.

Daripada lapan ciri PLC yang dikenal pasti di sekolah Inggeris (Bolam et al, 2005), hanya empat ciri sahaja yang menunjukkan evidens yang kuat dan konsisten daripada penggubal dasar dan merentasi empat sekolah menengah senior. Ciri PLC yang paling berkembang ialah:
- Perkongsian nilai dan visi,
- Tanggungjawab secara kolektif terhadap pembelajaran pelajar,
- Kolaborasi berfokus kepada pembelajaran,
- Pembelajaran profesional secara kumpulan dan individu

In terms of the eight particular PLC characteristics identified in English schools (Bolam et al, 2005), there was generally strong consistent evidence from policy makers and across the four senior secondary schools on four out of eight characteristics. The most developed PLC features comprised:

- *shared value and vision*,
- *collective responsibility for student learning*,
- *collaboration focused on learning*,
- *group and individual professional learning*.

Bagi dua lagi ciri PLC, evidens adalah bergabung: saling percaya, hormat dan sokongan, dan keterbukaan, jaringan dan perkongsian. Mengikut staf sekolah, ciri jaringan dan perkongsian dengan jelas berkait dengan jumlah dana yang disediakan. Sebaliknya, ciri PLC yang paling sukar difahami ialah:
- inkuiri reflektif profesional
- keahlian inklusif

Meanwhile, the evidence was more mixed for two PLC features: *mutual trust, respect and support* and *openness, networks and partnerships*, with the latter feature clearly linked by school staff to the extent of funding opportunities. In contrast, the most challenging PLC features were found to be:

- *reflective professional enquiry*
- *inclusive Membership*

Ciri inklusif ialah ciri PLC yang paling kurang difahami. Respons sekolah kepada idea ini adalah pelbagai tetapi secara tipikalnya, ia berfokus kepada ciri pemisahan tanggungjawab sokongan staf. Dari aspek inkuiri reflektif profesional, ia seakan-akan terlalu formal dan dimonitor di China. Akibatnya, sebilangan pihak yang berkepentingan telah beranggapan bahawa refleksi guru agak cetek atau terlalu fokus kepada kejayaan dalam peperiksaan sahaja. Pengurusan guru biasanya berhierarki dan terdapat sedikit sahaja peluang untuk menjadi pemimpin bersama. Hal ini menyebabkan motivasi guru lebih kepada insentif eksternal seperti kriteria kenaikan pangkat. Yang lebih menarik ialah dapatan tentang guru-guru muda dan sebilangan bukan guru yang seolah-olah dapat melahirkan idea yang lebih progresif tetapi hierarki sosial dan organisasi telah menyukarkan mereka untuk memberikan sumbangan. Variasi sejauh mana fenomena ini berlaku adalah mengikut sekolah. Ia berkait rapat dengan idea saling percaya, hormat dan sokongan. Faktornya berbeza-beza di antara keempat-empat buah sekolah di China tetapi terbukti dalam PLC yang lebih matang.

Inclusiveness was the least easily understood concept. The response of schools to this idea varied but typically was focused on the separate nature of support staff responsibilities. In terms of reflective

professional enquiry, this appears to be highly formalized and monitored in Chinese schools and some stakeholders consequently considered teachers reflections to be rather superficial or much too focused on examination success. The management of teachers is typically hierarchical and lacks opportunities for distributed leadership, which may result in teachers' being motivated mainly by external incentives such as promotion criteria. Interestingly junior teachers and some non-teachers seemed to express the more progressive ideas but the social and organizational hierarchy may impede their contribution. The extent to which this is evident varies between schools and links to ideas of mutual trust, respect and support, a factor which also seemed to differ between the four Chinese schools but nevertheless is clearly evident in more mature PLCs.

Bagi menyokong pembangunan PLC yang lebih baik dalam konteks China, guru dan penggubal dasar telah menunjukkan aktiviti yang dilaksanakan oleh pemimpin dan Jabatan Pentadbiran Pendidikan di semua peringkat (sekolah, wilayah, kebangsaan) ialah kunci dan melibatkan dasar dan kaedah penilaian pembangunan profesional guru dan pencapaian pelajar. Isu ini adalah penting dan dicadangkan agar konsep PLC diadaptasi ke dalam konteks China. Aspek-aspek yang perlu diambil kira dalam menghalusi konsep PLC di China termasuklah mengiktiraf:

In terms of how PLC development could be better supported in the Chinese context, teachers and policy makers indicated that the activity by leaders and educational administrative departments at all levels (school, region, national) was key and closely involved the policy and method of evaluating teacher's professional development and student outcomes. This issue is important and suggests that the PLC concept needs to be adapted to the Chinese context. Aspects that need to be considered in refining the PLC concept in China include acknowledging:

- Konteks budaya Confucius, iaitu banyak pelajar, ibu bapa dan masyarakat secara meluas dan kebiasaannya lebih menghargai keputusan peperiksaan awam berbanding lain-lain pencapaian dalam pendidikan.
- Kewujudan perbezaan yang besar dalam pembangunan sosioekonomi dan perspektif tradisional antara konteks timur dan barat, dan pedalaman dan bandar; kesannya adalah kesukaran untuk melaksanakan PLC di kawasan yang miskin.
- Kekuatan pedagogi dan kolaborasi sedia ada. Begitu juga dengan hierarki dan persaingan yang biasanya memandang ringan peranan anggota kakitangan bukan mengajar dan ibu bapa, dan tidak memudahkan kepimpinan bersama.
- Keperluan dasar kerajaan dan wilayah yang eksplisit dalam menyokong pembangunan PLC di sekolah-sekolah dan dana untuk latihan guru dan pihak yang berkepentingan dalam konsep PLC.

- A Confucian heritage context, where many students, their parents and society more broadly, typically value high stakes examination results above all other educational outcomes.
- Large differences exist in socio-economic development and traditional perspectives between east and west and rural and urban contexts; consequently new ideas such as PLCs may be more difficult to implement in some poorer areas.
- The strength of existing pedagogies and collaboration, as well as hierarchies and competition, which typically down plays the role of non-teaching support staff and parents and does not facilitate distributed leadership.
- The need for explicit government and regional policy to support PLC development in schools as well as funding for training teachers and other stakeholders in the PLC concept.

Maklumat terakhir yang sangat penting ialah kepimpinan ketua dan sokongan daripada seluruh pejabat kerajaan daerah dan kebangsaan ialah kunci untuk memberi lebih kuasa kepada guru bagi mengambil

lebih banyak tanggungjawab dalam pembelajaran dan penambahbaikan sekolah. Masa dan latihan yang secukupnya juga perlu untuk kebiasaan baharu bercambah. Walau bagaimanapun, variasi yang besar dalam penyediaan dana akan wujud. Hal ini perlu diuruskan dengan berkesan agar dapat memberi lebih banyak peluang kepada sekolah-sekolah pedalaman dan para guru untuk terlibat secara lebih aktif dalam pembangunan PLC.

The last point is crucial given the leadership of the head and support from the whole district and national government is key to empower teachers to take more responsibilities themselves for their own learning and school improvement. Adequate time and training is also necessary for new habits to be cultivated, although it is likely that large variations in funding across regions and schools needs to be better addressed to provide more opportunities for rural schools and teachers to be actively engaged in PLC development.

Secara keseluruhannya, evidens ITDEQC menunjukkan bahawa reformasi pendidikan dalam pembangunan guru dan peningkatan pencapaian pelajar boleh diperkukuh melalui pembangunan PLC yang direka khas untuk China atau negara Asia Timur yang mempunyai konteks yang sama. Pihak yang berkepentingan secara jelas menyatakan bahawa latihan dan perkakas penilaian PLC mampu menambah baik amalan pembangunan profesional dan agensi guru. Sekolah-sekolah ITDEQC melaporkan bahawa staf yang telah menerima latihan ini mendapat pemahaman yang lebih baik terhadap ciri-ciri PLC yang efektif seperti amalan pengajaran yang reflektif dan kepimpinan bersama. Dalam sebilangan kes, sekolah-sekolah tersebut juga memperkenalkan strategi yang lebih efektif untuk menyokong dan melestari sekolah sebagai PLC. Sebagai contohnya, penglibatan kakitangan bukan mengajar lebih digalakkan. Pengajarannya ialah pembangunan PLC yang diadaptasi dalam konteks budaya Confucius dan prioriti negara adalah penting untuk membawa perubahan yang diperlukan bagi memperbaiki kualiti dan ekuiti di China dan juga negara Asia Timur yang mempunyai sistem yang sama. Walau bagaimanapun, perubahan ini sukar untuk dicapai tanpa kebenaran dan sokongan yang eksplisit daripada pembuat polisi dan pemimpin sekolah. Impak perubahan juga akan menjadi terhad tanpa pembahagian sumber yang sama rata di antara semua sekolah dan wilayah.

Overall, we would argue that the ITDEQC evidence indicates that educational reforms around teacher development and improving student outcomes could be enhanced through PLC development tailored for the Chinese or similar East Asian contexts. Stakeholders clearly indicated that PLC evaluation tools and training could improve professional development practices and teacher agency. ITDEQC schools reported that staff who had received such training had developed a better understanding of the features of more effective PLCs, such as reflective teaching practices and distributed leadership. In some cases ITDEQC schools had also subsequently introduced more effective strategies to promote and sustain the school as a PLC, such as greater involvement of non-teaching support staff. The important lesson learned is that PLC development adapted to Confucian heritage contexts and country priorities has the potential to be very powerful in bringing about the changes needed to improve quality and equity in the Chinese and similar east Asian education systems. However, this is unlikely to be achieved without explicit endorsement and support from policy makers and school leaders and impact may be limited without a fairer distribution of resources across schools and regions.

_____

_____

Further Reading

Bolam, R., McMahon, A., Stoll, L., Thomas, S., Wallace, M, Hawkey, K. and Greenwood, A. (2005) *Creating and Sustaining Effective Professional Learning Communities*. DfES Research Report RR637. University of Bristol.

Chinese Ministry of Education [CMOE] (2010) 国家中长期教育改革和发展规划纲要 (2010-2020 年）The guidelines of the national plan for medium- and long-term educational reform and development (2010-2020). Retrieved 30 July 2010. from http://www.moe.gov.cn/publicfiles/business/htmlfiles/moe/moe_838/201008/93704.html

Hannum, E., Park, A., & Cheng., K.-M. (2007). Introduction: market reforms and educational opportunity in china. In E. Hannum & A. Park (Eds.), *Education and Reform in China*. Oxford: Routledge.

IEEQC/ITDEQC (2017) http://www.bristol.ac.uk/education/research/sites/ieeqc/

Li(李清臣), Q.-C. L. (2013). 困境与超越:专业学习共同体下的学习文化构建 Construction of learning environment from the perspective of professional learning community. 河北师范大学学报(教育科学版)Journal of Hebei Normal University(Educational Science Edition), 15(2), 34-38

Lomos, Catalina; Hofman, Roelande H. & Bosker, Roel J. (2012) Professional communities and student achievement – a meta-analysis, *School Effectiveness and School Improvement: An International Journal of Research, Policy and Practice*, 22:2, 121-148

Peng, W-J., McNess, E., Thomas, SM., Wu, X., Zhang, C., Li, J. & Tian, H. (2013). Emerging Perceptions of Teacher Quality and Teacher Development in China. *International Journal of Educational Development*, http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2013.04.005

Robinson, B., & Yi, W. (2008). The role and status of non-governmental ('daike') teachers in China's rural education. International Journal of Educational Development, 28(1), 35-54.

Sargent, T. C., & Hannum, E. (2009). Doing More With Less: Teacher Professional Learning Communities in Resource-Constrained Primary Schools in Rural China *Journal of Teacher Education, 60*(3), 258-276.

Stoll, L., Bolam, R., McMahon, A., Thomas, S., Wallace, M., Greenwood, A. and Hawkey, K. (2006) *Professional Learning Communities: Source Materials for School Leaders and Other Leaders of Professional Learning*. London: Innovation Unit, DfES, NCSL and GTC.

Stoll, L. & Seashore Louis, K. (Eds.), Professional learning communities: Divergence, depth and dilemmas. Berkshire, England: Open University Press

Teddlie, C., & Liu, S. (2008). Examining teacher effectiveness within differentially effective primary schools in the People's Republic of China. School Effectiveness and School Improvement, 19(4), 387-407.

Thomas, S (2010) *Evaluating Schools as Learning Communities.* International Encyclopaedia of Education. 3rd Edition. Elsevier

Thomas, S; & Peng, WJ (2014) Final Report ITDEQC project. Final project report submitted to ESRC/DFID funding programme.   University   of   Bristol.   (see http://www.bristol.ac.uk/education/research/sites/ieeqc/)

Thomas, SM., Peng, W-J., Li, J., (2015) 中国学校增值表现趋势研究–兼评增值与教师专业发展的关联性 (Time Trends in School Value Added Performance and the Relationship between Value Added and Teachers Professional Development in China). Educational Researcher 35 (7) 64-72. Beijing: National Institute for Education Sciences.

Wang, T. (2015) Contrived collegiality versus genuine collegiality: demystifying professional learning communities in Chinese schools, *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 45:6, 908-930

Wong, J. L. N. (2010). Searching for good practice in teaching: a comparison of two subject-based professional learning communities in a secondary school in Shanghai. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education, 40*(5), 623-639.

Zhang, Tiedao., & Zhao, Minxia. (2006). Universalizing nine-year compulsory education for poverty reduction in rural China. *International review of education*,52(3), 261-286

Zhao(赵明仁), M.-R., Zhou(周钧), J., & Zhu(朱旭东), X.-D. (2009). 北京市中小学教师参与专业发展活动现状与需求的调查研究 A survey on the participation and needs of primary and secondary school teachers' professional development. 教师教育研究 Teacher Education Research, 21(1), 62-67.